SUMMONS ISSUED

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

WILLIAM B. HUNTE on behalf of himself and all other similarly situated consumers

Plaintiff.

Defendant.

-against-

MONARCH RECOVERY MANAGEMENT, INC.

FILED
IN CLERK'S OFFICE
US DISTRICT COURT ED NY

★ APR 2 2 2013

LONG ISLAND OFFICE

VITALIANO, J.

REYES, JR, M.

CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT

Introduction

1. Plaintiff William B. Hunte seeks redress for the illegal practices of Monarch Recovery Management, Inc. concerning the collection of debts, in violation of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1692, et seq. ("FDCPA").

Parties

- 2. Plaintiff is a citizen of the State of New York who resides within this District.
- 3. Plaintiff is a consumer as that term is defined by Section § 1692(a)(3) of the FDCPA, in that the alleged debt that Defendant sought to collect from Plaintiff a consumer debt.
- Upon information and belief, Defendant's principal place of business is located in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.
- 5. Defendant is regularly engaged, for profit, in the collection of debts allegedly owed by consumers.

6. Defendant is a "debt collector" as that term is defined by the FDCPA, 15 U.S.C. § 1692(a)(6).

Jurisdiction and Venue

- 7. This Court has federal question jurisdiction under 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d) and 28 U.S.C. § 1331.
- 8. Venue is proper in this district pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b), as the acts and transactions that give rise to this action occurred, in substantial part, in this district.

Allegations Particular to William B. Hunte

- Upon information and belief, on a date better known by Defendant, Defendant began to attempt to collect an alleged consumer debt from the Plaintiff.
- 10. On or about December 3, 2012, Defendant sent the Plaintiff a collection letter seeking to collect a balance allegedly incurred for personal purposes.
- 11. Said letter stated in pertinent part: "This is to advise you that your account has been transferred to our office for collection by CITIBANK, N.A. As of the date of this letter you owe \$3869.97 The amount due on the day you pay may be greater as interest, late fees, and other charges may be added by the creditor. Hence, if you pay the total balance due shown above, an adjustment may be necessary after we receive your payment. You may call us at 1-800-220-0605 at any time to check your outstanding balance. If you choose to pay the balance in full, the creditor is willing to accept a settlement of 40% of the total balance due, which is ***\$1559.89*** as of the date of this letter. Please note that this settlement amount will change if the total balance due changes. The offer does not cancel nor override your dispute rights set forth below."

- 7. Said language is vague as to a mechanism for the consumer to determine exactly how much the debt will be on a date certain.
- 8. The Seventh Circuit in <u>Miller v. McCalla</u> suggested certain language giving the consumer the opportunity to call or write to find out the exact amount due.
- 12. Said language also threatens "late fees, and other charges" of which the Defendant does not engage.
- 13. In addition, the said letter does not provide a mechanism for the consumer to determine the exact amount of the total balance due and if the settlement amount will be in effect if the consumer pays the said \$1559.89
- 14. The said language leaves the Plaintiff unsure of the final amount of the debt; i.e. once she has paid the said amount, will this be the final amount or would she be subjected to more fees.
- 15. The least sophisticated consumer may be led to think that he is in default on the agreement.
- 16. Defendant's letter is in violation of 15 U.S.C. §§ 1692e(5) and 1692e(10) for engaging in deceptive practices.

AS AND FOR A FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION

Violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act brought by Plaintiff on behalf of herself and the members of a class, as against the Defendant.

- 17. Plaintiff re-states, re-alleges, and incorporates herein by reference, paragraphs one (1) through sixteen (16) as if set forth fully in this cause of action.
- 18. This cause of action is brought on behalf of Plaintiff and the members of a class.

- 19. The class consists of all persons whom Defendant's records reflect resided in the State of New York and who were sent a collection letter in substantially the same form as the letter sent to the Plaintiff on or about December 3, 2012; and (a) the collection letter was sent to a consumer seeking payment of a personal debt purportedly owed to CITIBANK., N.A.; and (b) the collection letter was not returned by the postal service as undelivered; (c) and the Plaintiff asserts that the letter contained violations of 15 U.S.C. §§ 1692e(5) and 1692e(10) for false threats of deceptive actions.
- 20. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23, a class action is appropriate and preferable in this case because:
 - (A) Based on the fact that a form collection letter is at the heart of this litigation, the class is so numerous that joinder of all members is impracticable.
 - (B) There are questions of law and fact common to the class and these questions predominate over any questions affecting only individual class members. The principal question presented by this claim is whether the Defendant violated the FDCPA.
 - (C) The only individual issue is the identification of the consumers who receive such collection letters, (i.e. the class members), a matter capable of ministerial determination from the records of Defendant.
 - (D) The claims of the Plaintiff are typical of those of the class members. All are based on the same facts and legal theories.
 - (E) The Plaintiff will fairly and adequately represent the class members' interests. The Plaintiff has retained counsel experienced in bringing class actions and collection-abuse claims. The Plaintiff's interests are consistent with those of the

members of the class.

- 21. A class action is superior for the fair and efficient adjudication of the class members' claims. Congress specifically envisions class actions as a principal means of enforcing the FDCPA. 15 U.S.C. § 1692(k). The members of the class are generally unsophisticated individuals, whose rights will not be vindicated in the absence of a class action. Prosecution of separate actions by individual members of the classes would create the risk of inconsistent or varying adjudications resulting in the establishment of inconsistent or varying standards for the parties and would not be in the interest of judicial economy.
- 22. If the facts are discovered to be appropriate, the Plaintiff will seek to certify a class pursuant to Rule 23(b)(3) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.
- 23. Collection attempts, such as those made by the Defendant are to be evaluated by the objective standard of the hypothetical "least sophisticated consumer."

Violations of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act

- 24. The Defendant's actions as set forth above in the within complaint violates the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act.
- 25. Because the Defendant violated of the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, the Plaintiff and the members of the class are entitled to damages in accordance with the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act.

WHEREFORE. Plaintiff, respectfully requests that this Court enter judgment in her favor and against the Defendant and award damages as follows:

(a) Statutory and actual damages provided under the FDCPA, 15 U.S.C. §

1692(k);

- (b) Attorney fees, litigation expenses and costs incurred in bringing this action; and
- (c) Any other relief that this Court deems appropriate and just under the circumstances.

Dated: Cedarhurst, New York

April 18, 2013

Adam J. Fishbein, P.C. (AF-9508)

Attorney At Law

Attorney for the Plaintiff

483 Chestnut Street

Cedarhurst, New York 11516

Telephone (516) 791-4400

Facsimile (516) 791-4411

Plaintiff requests trial by jury on all issues so triable.

Adam J. Fishbein (AF-9508)

10005 Octobrand Philosophia PA 18164 3210 RETURN SERVICE REQUESTED

აძია 1180-740 აგეგევუგი - |||განა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა| - ||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა| - ||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გენა||გე

Property 1: 1 Carpane Recovery Management, Inc.

MONARCH

Make Clieck Payates to Cizacop Credit Services NONARCH RECOVERY MANAGEMENT, INC. P.O. DOX 10119 PI-ILACCUPHA FA 1911-ROW

"Coinch and Ratum Top Parties to Expectle Your Account"

ACCOUNT INFORMATION Generality 2012 Cestar Chibate A Account Heromany Control Contro
ACCOUNT INFORMATION ACCOUNT INFORMATION CREATE SERVICE CREATE AGRICULTURE INFORMATION ENGINEER ACCOUNT INFORMATION ACCOUNT INFOR
NECHNIKTION GRUNNECK A GRUNN
ALCHENYLLY STANS LYCC

This is to advise you that your occount has been kaneteried to our office for colorism by CITIBANN, NA

As of the defo of the Julier you owe \$3659.97. The amount due on the day you pay may be girssal as interest into sort, and other charges may be exclud by the coedilor. Henco, if you pay the cotal lastence due shown above, an sujectment day be necessary after no introduce your payment. You may call us at 1-400-220-0500 at any time to

ff you et orca not to jusy the bulance in tull, the creditor is witing to accept a southement of 40% of the total bulance duc, which is ™ £1559.99 ™ 86 of the delit of this labor. Ploces note that this seltenment entountwit of angolf the Loai Lubinos due changes. The offer does not cancel not overlate you disjude 19718-98 (only below

Wheleses 1800,000 or name of a deb) is largices as a result of selling a debt by less first the tabance using the creation may be required in reserving amount of field debt to given to the IRS on a 10920 found, a capy of which usual do make the resided virtual selector. If you are uncertained the public business you by the deador. If you are uncertained the public field by the public field of the public field of the selector of the content of the public field of the selector of the content of the public field of the selector of the content of the public field of the selector of the content of the content of the public field of the selector of the content of

Unisses you neitly this effice with a do days after receiving this notice that you dispand the valuity of this debt or any partially idenced, the office will assume into doth if write if you notice this waiting further 30 cts. In 50 cts. In the solid is write if you notice this waiting further 30 cts. In waiting within 30 cts. In the solid is write if you not be suffered as a copy of a superior and mail you a copy of partial pure and you across one of the solid and you have a solid problem. If you necessed of this ordice it was a filter suit text by so create it is a first a following the solid problem of the solid partial partial in the solid interest of this ordice. If office suit formed it continues an afternate by a desix collector to collect a debt. Foy information should be solid this problem. The communication is from a debt collector if you pay us by directs or death by posse your transpraism will be converted to an AGN. Additionally, that there waiter suitables is organized in the present life slue? I sprovisculf if the check is refurted to maintain or uncollected funds in Acia new elects charge of \$3.00 may be saided to your account if such check, it lighted in cumpled as maps if

li Sput ließe & Compaint eitral toe way van ero criecting hist und, stesse write to our Compaint de Conten et 1995 Decale PRost, Philadophia, PA 19144, ernet us et compaiance@micraenchmone, ent lus teldes et 1-500-20; 0:08 est −201, beween ±100 A.D Eastern Titele and 600-91 bil Sealem Titele Moutely-Fellen. Federal Iss prohibits certain mathors, of debt cofrozion, amerequies that we heat you herry if or on into us from codecatig you by prior a signor to us feet this us to stop the context. Smoting such a scleen does not have the dat go away they are of to once we technic and fellor, wanter not context you upan, except to list you know that there will not be day make contact or that ye intend to gate a specific action.

The Federal Trade Committé de edicates the Fair Laba Cellaction Positices Act (FDC/A) il yenthere a comitaint BIVAL Pie Way Vis Recolecting your cate, please confect the FTC online at years fit, gor by pinone at 1-577-FTC. Hell-P. In: by mailt at 600 Pennsylvania Kwe, New, Yearfrojjon, OCC XUSEO

Katie owens, dest collector ext 2522

idew York City Department of Consumer Altake Literase #1346061 and #1345050

Motorcy Research Hanagement, Inc. + 11865 Decembrage + Phinadelphia, PA 15104 (800) 270-0805 or 1(215) 28:-7930 + Hours, M-TH Batti - 11grol, F Batti - figm